DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 437 241 RC 022 191

AUTHOR Duff, Betty Parker
TITLE The "Quare" Women: Reformers and Settlement Workers in the Kentucky Mountains.
PUB DATE 1999-10-00
NOTE 16p.; Paper presented at the conference "The Women of Appalachia: Their Heritage and Accomplishments" (Zanesville, OH, October 27-29, 1999).
PUB TYPE Historical Materials (060) -- Information Analyses (070) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Acculturation; Adult Education; Elementary Education; *Females; *Modernization; *Rural Education; Social History; Social Values; *Womens Education
IDENTIFIERS Appalachia; *Kentucky (East); *Settlement Schools

ABSTRACT

Among the many outside influences on Appalachian culture in the late 19th-early 20th centuries were reformers and educators, many of them women who came to the mountains to work as teachers, settlement workers, and nurses. This paper focuses on settlement schools in eastern Kentucky as the locus of interaction between reformers and mountain women. It addresses P. Pascoe's theory of reform work as "rescue" operations and questions whether mountain settlements were successful as rescue missions for Appalachian women and children. As in urban settlements of the Progressive Era, mountain settlements concentrated on providing Christian, morally uplifting environments, and aimed to establish the mother as the moral authority in the family. The isolated region was seen as relatively untouched by "corrupting" outside influences and, therefore, ideal for carrying out systematic cultural intervention. College educated women from the East found a sense of purpose in the settlement schools: to educate and enlighten the backward mountain people by teaching them moral values, proper nutrition and health care, sanitary housekeeping practices, and community values. Welcomed and respected by their communities, the teachers and staff found a viable alternative to marriage and motherhood. Unquestionably, the settlement workers brought improvements to the region, but their Victorian ideology prevented them from challenging the patriarchal power structure; confronting the realities of exploitative, outside economic forces; or empowering the people, especially women, to deal with the challenges of the future. (Contains 42 references.) (SV)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 437 241

THE "QUARE" WOMEN: REFORMERS AND SETTLEMENT WORKERS IN THE KENTUCKY MOUNTAINS

Betty Parker Duff
University of Maine

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Betty Parker Duff

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

RC 022191

THE "QUARE" WOMEN: REFORMERS AND SETTLEMENT WORKERS IN THE KENTUCKY MOUNTAINS

Betty Parker Duff
University of Maine

Among the many outside influences on Appalachian culture in the late 19th and early 20th centuries were reformers and educators, many of them women, who came to the mountains to work as teachers, settlement workers and nurses. This paper focuses on the settlement schools in eastern Kentucky as the locus of interaction between reformers and mountain women. It addresses Peggy Pascoe's theory of reform work as "rescue" operations and questions whether the founding of mountain settlements were successful as rescue missions for the women and children of the region.

According to Appalachian historian Loyal Jones, three reformist movements converged at the turn of the century: Progressivism, the Social Gospel, and the settlement movement. Such movements appealed to many privileged women, especially the newly educated who found access to most professions available only to men.[1] The social reform movement was especially strong in the Northeast where industrialization and an ever-increasing immigrant population posed a constant threat to the social order. Concern among upper and middle-class groups and individuals stemmed from a need to preserve social order mixed with the ideology of *noblesse oblige*, the belief that the privileged had an obligation to intervene on behalf of those less fortunate than themselves.

Progressive era historians often link social reform efforts with industrialism. Paul Boyer, in *Urban Masses and Moral Order in America, 1820-1920*, sets the beginning of the urban movement for social order at 1820.[2] And, according to Peggy Pascoe in *Relations of Rescue*, female moral reform originated in roughly the same time period in the Protestant benevolent movement.[3] In tracing the origin of the settlements, Pascoe found that "middle-class and elite women inspired by evangelical faith in human perfectibility or by a sense of *noblesse oblige* provided charity for people left adrift in the burgeoning, and often bewildering, commercial urban development".[4]

Though these movements had similar origins, they differed significantly according to geographic and cultural setting. Pascoe focuses on the home mission movement in the American West where the strategy employed for achieving the goal of female moral authority differs somewhat from that of urban settlements:

> Taking for granted the "separate spheres" middle class Victorians assigned to men and women, home mission women worked within the assumptions of and through the network of the Victorian women's culture. Starting from two conventional values of true womanhood--piety and purity--and the equally conventional notion of the Christian home, they used Victorian women's identification with morality to press for authority in American society. In the process they stretched these conventions almost beyond recognition. . . . "the Christian home" was identified

RC 022191

> with the moral authority of women rather than the patriarchal control of men; the term implied criticism of male domination in families.[5]

Urban settlements concentrated on providing Christian, morally uplifting, environments for men as well as women, though in separate institutions. But whether dealing with urban populations of immigrants, Chinese prostitutes, Mormon women in polygamous marriages, or native American women, the target was the family and the goal was to establish the mother rather than the father as the moral authority in the family.

This was the also true in the mountain settlement movement. Frustrated by their lack of success in instilling Protestant and Republican values in urban freedmen, these "soldiers of light and love" as scholar Jacqueline Jones calls them, shifted their attention to mountain whites. David Whisnant, in his critique of the reform movement in the Southern Appalachians, *All That is Native and Fine,* states that "newly thrust upon the public consciousness by a stream of post-Civil War local-color fiction and the burgeoning coal and timber industries, the mountains began to claim a greater and greater share of missionary attention.[6]

According to Southern historian Paul Harvey, missionaries were the first reformers to come to the mountains:

> The Appalachian region, home to people 'of the most unmixed Anglo-Saxon stock," according to national mythology, saw an intensive missionizing campaign conducted by all the major southern denominations in the late nineteenth century. The Presbyterians beat other groups to the field, but the SBC [Southern Baptist Church] was not far behind. The region was full of independent Baptist churches, a legacy of antimissionism.[7]

Whisnant, however, sees the mission movement as only one of the forces acting on the mountain culture. He lists

> four "profoundly important, interrelated processes going on in the mountains—and in the South generally—at the end of the nineteenth century: economic colonization by northeastern capital; the rise of indigenous resistance among workers and farmers; the discovery of indigenous culture by writers, collectors, popularizers, and elite-art composers and concertizers; and the proliferation of (mostly Protestant)missionary endeavors.[8]

Ron Eller, author of *Miners, Millhands and Mountaineers* agrees:

> As early as the 1870s, writers for the new monthly magazines which flourished after the Civil War had begun to develop and exploit a literary image of the region . . . between 1870 and 1890 over two hundred travel accounts and short stories were published in which the mountain people emerged as a rude, backward, romantic, and sometimes violent race who had quietly lived for generations in isolation from the mainstreams of American life.[9]

In his Ph.D. dissertation on Pine Mountain Settlement School in the Eastern Kentucky mountains, James Greene III concurs that the intent of such accounts was to draw attention to the area and its resources. He says, "The newspapers of the late eighties and early nineties were full of stories of mountain feuds and of the prospects for mountain industrialization." .[10] Eller takes the connection a step further and argues that it was in the best interest of investors and entrepreneurs to promote the negative aspects of mountain life. He maintains that "during the twentieth century, 'hillbilly culture' would become the standard means of rationalizing the poverty of an exploited region. In the late nineteenth century, it became the major justification for the swift acquisition of mountain land and resources by outsiders". Furthermore, he sees a common purpose in the efforts of capitalist entrepreneurs and the reformers:

> As capitalists worked to bring the resources of the land into the industrial age, intellectuals increasingly strove to "uplift" and "Americanize" the mountaineers. The two groups occasionally differed over tactics for changing the region--businessmen emphasizing the need for economic development while most missionaries spoke of cultural change, education, and human concern--but ultimately both were components of the larger modernizing process.[11]

Paul Harvey's research supports Eller's argument. He states that "along with the development of mines, coke furnaces, and railroads, came the educated minister, the church budget, Sunday schools, and missionary societies."[12] Drawing this parallel, however, fails to take into account the fact that the arrival of the settlement workers in 1899 preceded the building of the railroads through the mountains that made large scale logging and mining possible.

In the case of the mountain settlement schools, it is likely that, as James Greene concluded from his study, the remoteness of the mountain schools, unlike their urban counterparts which were actively involved in dealing with the problems of industrialized society, were intended to provide a refuge from the "evils" of industrialization. The sites chosen were rugged mountainous areas relatively untouched by outside influences, fitting John R. Stilgoe's description of a utopia, a place "ringed by wilderness . . . characterized by home-based farm work and handicrafts, focused about a symbolic center, and interlaced with short-distance paths." Green suggests that the isolation that had shielded the region from "corrupting" outside influences made the settlements ideal proving grounds for testing the reformers' social work skills and for putting into practice some of the educational and social reform theories popular in Europe.

David Whisnant argues a similar point. He uses the term *systematic cultural intervention* to describe the conscious and programmatic "action within a culture with the intent of affecting it in some specific way that the intervenor thinks desirable." He views the founders of the settlement schools in Eastern Kentucky, North Carolina and Tennessee as cultural exploiters of mountain people. "Culture was . . . central to missionary work in the mountains," he argues. In *All That is Native and Fine,* he quotes from *The Carolina Churchman:*

> Another potent asset, that should appeal to the lover of America and American institutions, is that these southern Appalachian mountains are giving to the nation every year 100,000 citizens of the purest American type, which is no

> inconsiderable item when we know that fifty per cent increase in many of our large cities is made up of a low type of immigrants from the slums of Europe.[13]

The assumed homogeneity of the population and their isolation would have provided a nearly perfect control group for instilling Christian values and republican ideals of family, citizenship and community in "pure" Anglo Saxons free of "contamination" by association with backs or immigrants.[14] Not only did the settlement women consciously strive to alter the behavior of the mountain people, they collected, preserved, and promoted their crafts and music, selecting only those items that, in their opinion, were, in Whisnant's words, "native and fine." To the promoters of mountain culture, the schools provided an ideal setting for displaying the handicrafts and performing the ballads and folklore which they presented as authentic representations of a society nearly unchanged since Elizabethan times because of the isolation from outside influences.

In her dissertation on the founders of Hindman settlement school Rhonda England takes issue with the negative implications of the term *systematic cultural intervention* in relation to the settlements. Though England agrees with some of Whisnant's arguments, she insists that the cultural gains the reformers brought to Southern Appalachia far outweigh the losses. She argues t that "maintaining and preserving mountain culture was a major goal for both Pettit and Stone", the two founders of Hindman Settlement School, but like other reformers, believed that education was the principal means of "civilizing" the mountain people and bringing them into the American mainstream. As Alan Davis points out in his excellent study of the reform movement, *Spearheads of Reform*, settlement schools differed from missions and charitable organizations in that settlements concerned themselves with "poverty of opportunity" rather than poverty of material needs. The emphasis was on "uplift" of the individual, but in the mountain schools, interestingly omitted from Davis' study, the settlement workers, like the charity workers, were reluctant to become involved in political or social reform. And though the schools were secular, the teaching of three R's, domestic skills for girls and industrial training for boys were supplemented by a large dose of Christian morality and Bible lessons.[15]

The settlement school movement in the Kentucky mountains began with the reading of a letter from the Reverend T. J. Mitchell, a Presbyterian minister from Hazard, Kentucky, at a meeting of Kentucky Federation of Women's Clubs in 1898. The letter contained the following request:

> Cannot the State Federation send us a woman, a dear old-fashioned woman, young or old, who can win women's true rights in that conquest, that in itself is simply being a woman? What do I want of a woman? I want her a few weeks of the coming summer to assist in the conduct of meetings of wives, mothers, housekeepers, young ladies and little girls. Lessons and lectures in cooking and homemaking should be made particularly enthusiastic and then the intellectual and moral features can be made interesting.[16]

While the mountain people may have been anti-missionary, Rev. Mitchell's letter indicates that they would welcome secular education, especially the teaching of domestic skills for women and girls.

Katherine Pettit, May Stone and others who accompanied them to the Kentucky mountains in the summer of 1898 were young women from well-to-do families in Western Kentucky and the East, educated at prestigious women's colleges where the latest in educational and social theories were taught.[17] Loyal Jones writes, "over a hundred young women followed Pettit and Stone to Eastern Kentucky, Most of them graduates of such colleges as Smith, Bryn Mawr, Mt. Holyoke, Wellesley, and Vassar."[18] Many had social connections to the prestigious Breckinridge family from Lexington, who figured prominently in the settlement movement. Two of the Breckinridge girls, Sophinisba and Curry Desha, attended Wellesley with May Stone. In addition to their family's financial support, they and their sister-in-law, Madeline McDowell Breckinridge, who later founded the Frontier Nursing Service, contributed to the mission by teaching and working at the settlement themselves for a time.[19] According to Jess Stoddard, editor of *The Quare Women's Journals,* Sophinisba was one of the closest friends of Jane Addams, founder of Hull House in Chicago. Stoddard argues that this was "a connection . . . of enormous importance both for the formulation of the ideas which guided the social settlement at Hindman and also for the financial support and volunteers provided by this contact."[20]

Both Pettit and Stone, two of the women who conducted the summer camps in 1899, 1900, and 1901, and the founders of Hindman Settlement School in 1902 were familiar with urban settlements. Though the mountain schools differed in a number of significant ways, they utilized many of the theories and practices already proven effective in urban settings. They knew Jane Addams personally and visited her at Hull House prior to establishing their school. Like Addams, they longed to live "useful" lives. Sara Evans, author of *Born for Liberty,* points out that the independent and self-supporting new woman who emerged during the Progressive era "had been formed in the intense world of women's colleges where they challenged conventional wisdom about women's intellectual capacities and developed deep and loving bonds with both teacher and sister students." But according to women's historian Alice Kessler-Harris, graduation brought discontent. "What were they now to do?" she asks. "They had, convention held, unfitted themselves for marriage. More than 75 percent of the generation of college women who graduated before 1900 remained single." Confident and self-reliant on the college campus, these women were treated like "invalid daughters" when they returned to their homes. Allen Davis, Jane Addams's biographer, writes, "No group felt more adrift than the first generation of college women . . . alone in a society that had no use for them." Settlement work provided not only a socially acceptable profession for women to exercise their new knowledge and skills, but the opportunity to recreate the woman-focused and woman-controlled environment of the women's college.[21]

Pettit exemplified the "new woman" who became involved in social reform. Her family had been part of the bluegrass gentry since pioneer days and she was educated at Lexington's Sayre Female Institute. Baptized a Presbyterian at a time when the missionary movement was at its height, she had acquired a strong social conscience. Her interest in the Kentucky mountains was piqued by her father's concern for the mountain people, tales told by the ministers and college professors who visited their home, and newspaper accounts of the feuds and lawlessness that seemed endemic to the area. Here was a chance to provide a much desired and needed social service.[22]

The timing of Reverend Mitchell's request was providential. Pettit had a strong interest in establishing a mountain settlement, and had already made several trips to the Kentucky mountains. In 1895, she was drawn to Perry County by newspaper accounts of the famous French-Eversole feud, and while she was there, an appeal from a local woman convinced her of the mountain people's strong desire to be educated. A second trip in April, 1899, came about as the result of an invitation from Mary McCarty, a teacher at the Harlan Presbyterian Academy to tour the Pine Mountain area with her that spring. During that trip, two men who had learned of her interest in establishing a school approached her about starting a school on Pine Mountain. Later that spring, she returned with a group from the Women's Christian Temperance Union of Kentucky "to survey the field and assess needs." Representing both the WCTU and the Kentucky Federation of Women's Clubs, she became superintendent of a traveling library system which circulated books from community to community.[23]

Ample evidence exists that some mountain people welcomed the reformers and that the presence of the schools benefited the communities they served through health care reform and education of both adults and children. Hindman Settlement School, for example, is credited with helping to transform a feuding, backwoods community into a civilized town. With the exception of Whisnant, most authors and historians portray the reformers' activities in the mountains as an asset to the mountain culture, especially in promoting a sense of community and creating cultural opportunities for mountain people. In all cases the women were invited; in fact, accounts of the old patriarchs who begged them to come, even donating land and materials for building the schools, are so similar that one would suspect their veracity had they not been named: Uncle William Creech of Harlan at Pine Mountain, Bysh (Abisha) Johnson and "Uncle" Sam Slone at Caney Creek, and Solomon Everidge (Uncle Sol) at Hindman. According to these accounts, propertied mountain men felt that the settlement schools would provide civilizing influences that their communities sorely needed. Concerned for the increasing violence, lawlessness, and decline of moral values, they felt that education, especially the teaching of Christian virtue and domestic skills to women and children, would contribute to stable families and good citizenship. At the same time, they insisted that the schools remain non-denominational because they mistrusted religious groups who used schools to promote their doctrine. Men from the community supported the schools by building and maintaining the grounds and buildings and delivering mail and supplies. Male support reinforced the educators' conviction that they had both the right and the duty to provide models of behavior for the lawless population that threatened the stability of the Appalachian society.[24]

Settlement work gave the women who founded the mountain schools, like their urban counterparts, a sense of purpose. To educate and enlighten the "peculiar" and backward mountain people, especially the children; to teach them moral values, proper nutrition and health care, sanitary housekeeping practices and community values was a noble calling. Their position as defenders of home and family enabled them to exert influence on both male and female members of the community. The teachers and staff commanded a high level of respect from the community, and their role as educators served as a means of empowerment in a male-dominated society. Most importantly, the settlements offered educated women a socially acceptable and economically viable alternative to marriage and motherhood. Within a relatively protected and comfortable

environment, they were able to forge a community of women free of male domination.

One disadvantage, however, was the difficulty of getting in and out of the mountains. The very isolation that made the remote locations so desirable caused the majority of the hardships. There were no roads and few wagons. Since most travel was confined to creek beds or along ridges, heavy rains or snow could confine the women for days, making it impossible for them to obtain supplies and make home visits. Homesickness was a problem for some women, especially when they first arrived. In a letter to her mother in her native Rhode Island, Elizabeth Watts talks about missing her family, and adds, " . . . it's awful to be so far away much as I love it here".[25]

In Whisnant's assessment of the more self-serving aspects of the settlement women, he attributes their willingness to endure the hardships they encountered to their disestablishment in American life that confined women to "a narrowly conceived *culture* as their special concern."[26] At the same time that Eastern women's colleges were stressing educational and social reform, the greatest occupational need was teaching. Ironically, as historian Robert Weibe points out, "Ridiculed over the nineteenth century as Ichabod Cranes and fussy schoolmarms, teachers embodied the apparent paradox of exceptionally low prestige in a land that acclaimed universal education".[27] This was not the case in the mountain settlements. The strong support of religious and women's groups, primarily affluent women from Western Kentucky, and organizations such as the Women Christian Temperance Union and the Association of Kentucky Women's Clubs lent prestige to the mountain settlement workers. Female moral authority was vested in them not just by the women's organizations, but by the Presbyterian church, and the mountain people themselves.

Bolstered by such support, Pettit may have viewed the settlements as the kind of "rescue" mission described by Peggy Pascoe.[28] According to Green, Pettit saw women and children as the "underdogs" of mountain society. In a letter to a friend in 1899 Pettit wrote:

> It is the deplorable condition of the women that appeals so strongly to me. Their condition is truly wretched. The domestic life of the mountaineer is crude. They know absolutely nothing of decent living. How can they when the women who should be fitted for house keepers and homemakers are doing the work of men, who think their duty consists in hunting, fishing and sitting on the fence talking politics. While the women hurriedly cook their meals and spend the rest of the time in cultivating crops, building fences and milking cows . . . many of the country women marry, have large families and die without ever having the diversion of a visit to the little village of their county. The poor unfortunates who have not even this one opportunity must spend their lives, as Miss Henderson down on Laurel Fork told us "jest bummin around among their folks."[29]

This correspondence indicates that Pettit did, in fact, feel that the women needed to be rescued from male lack of responsibility as well as their domination.

Appalachian historian Horace Kephart's observations in 1913 support Pettit's opinion. Kephart portrays mountain life in this long quotation as

> a patriarchal existence. The man of the house is lord. He takes no orders from anyone at home or abroad. Whether he shall work or visit or roam the woods with dog and gun is nobody's affair but his own. About family matters he consults with his wife, but in the end his word is law. If Madame be a bit shrewish he is likely to tolerate it as natural to the weaker vessel: but if she should go too far he checks her with a curt "Shet up!" and the incident is closed.
>
> "The woman" as every wife is called, has her kingdom within the house, and her man seldom meddles with its administration. . . . The mountain farmer's wife is not only a household drudge but a field-hand as well. She helps to plant, hoes corn, gathers fodder, sometimes even plows or splits rails. . . . When her man leaves home on a journey he is not likely to have laid in wood for the stove or hearth: So she and the children must drag from the hillsides whatever dead timber they can find.
>
> Outside the towns no hat is lifted to maid or wife. A swain would consider it beneath his dignity. At table, if women be seated at all, the dishes are passed first to the men; but generally the wife stands by and serves. There is no conscious discourtesy in such customs; but they betoken and indifference to woman's weakness, a disregard for her finer nature, a denial of her proper rank, that are real and deep-seated in the mountaineer. To him she is little more than a sort of superior domestic animal. The chivalric regard for women that characterized our pioneers of the Far West is altogether lacking in the habits of the backwoodsman of Appalachia.[30]

Ironically, the effect of the settlement worker's focus on moral uplift and educating women and girls in domestic skills reinforced the cult of domesticity and the concept of separate spheres for men and women, which left patriarchal control intact. The emphasis on educating children to serve their mountain communities as leaders and professionals, directed girls into teaching and nursing, while boys prepared for law or medical careers. At Pine Mountain, Green says, "The domestic science and weaving programs were mainly for girls; boys in the early days derived much of their industrial training from direct experience on the farm, at the dairy, and on construction projects". The curriculum described was designed to prepare girls to be better homemakers and wives, to give birth to and properly raise the morally upright and community conscious citizens needed to populate a republican society.[31]

As word spread about the school, it became necessary to actively solicit additional funds in order to accommodate the growing demand.. Students from as far as fifty miles away applied for admission and many had to be turned away. Initially, financial support had come from wealthy families, national and state women's organizations, and from elite women's and Ivy League colleges. Contributions from student organizations at these colleges financed the building of dorms and student activity centers, many of which would bear the names of their benefactors: Harvard, Columbia, Wellesley, and Radcliffe among the notables. Families, friends, and the founders' own resources could be counted on when emergency funds were needed. The mountain people themselves donated land and labor. This new need for fund-raising presented a major challenge: how to make potential donors aware of the need without demeaning the

mountain people. Katherine Pettit, in particular, cautioned her teachers to exercise great care in describing the students and community members, even in personal correspondence. A teacher could be dismissed for insensitive portrayals of students and their families.[32]

But did the settlement women, in their attempt to solicit contributions, either deliberately or inadvertently contribute to the stereotyping of the mountain people? Greene acknowledges "the existence of "problems inherent when a group seemingly superior in knowledge tries to help those apparently less knowledgeable raise their standard of living."[33] Some of the methods the reformers used to obtain funds to operate their schools raise this important question. In order to justify the need for their continued presence it was necessary to "otherize" the mountain people, to portray them as poverty stricken and in dire need of health care, education, and the kind of "uplift" that only genteel women could provide. Biographer Davis describes the heroic efforts of Alice Lloyd, founder of Alice Lloyd College, who took a group of carefully selected boys she called the "Crusaders" on a fund-raising tour of Ohio, Pennsylvania, New York and Washington, where they sang and told the stories of the great need for education in the mountains. One of the real ironies of the fund-raising expedition was that on one occasion the boys were invited to stay at the home of Walter Teagle, a director of Standard Oil, one of the major corporations benefiting from the mountain resources at the expense of the local economy. Greene suggests that the demeaning nature of these fund-raising efforts angered many mountain people and seriously eroded the trust that the settlement women had worked so hard to establish.[34]

Evidence of mountain people's initial distrust of the outsiders is indicated by the terms "fotched-on", "furrin" and "quare women", the title of Lucy Furman's valuable, though biased, novel about the time she spent at Hindman. In Furman's account, however, settlement women are portrayed as "rescuing" angels who not only teach women how to be better wives and mothers, but are able to stop the feuds and the moonshining and make the husbands better men. Pettit and Stone's letters and journals stress the positive effects the settlement workers had on the culture. But the evidence indicates that the settlement women did not hold themselves to the same values they were teaching the mountain women. For example, unlike young mountain women, settlement women had little or no interest in marriage or raising families, a fact which, according to Furman, mystified the older women in the community who considered anyone over twenty-one and unmarried an old maid and an object of pity. Ironically, the "quare women's" lack of interest in marriage and apparent disregard for male protection and support made them less threatening to mountain women, since such attitudes prevented them from being considered rivals for eligible men.[35]

But until oral history projects were initiated by Appalachian colleges, historians had few means of determining how mountain women felt about their roles or their opinion of the settlement workers. Oral histories provide a means to get the mountain women's side of the story. A case in point is Verna Mae Slone's side of the story of Caney Creek School. In *Stay on, Stranger*, William S. Dutton's portrayal of Alice Lloyd and Caney Creek School, now Alice Lloyd College, he praises the reformers and credits them with numerous civilizing influences in mountain people's lives, changes that range from elevated standards of living and better health care to a decline in moonshining and feuds between rival clans. The college still proudly includes the Reader's Digest condensed version, "Stay on, Stranger" in its information packet.[36]

However, as the result of the Appalachian Oral History Project conducted in 1977, Dutton's version has now been challenged. One of the interviewees, Verna Mae Slone, gives her opinion of both the school and Dutton's article. The editors of this collection of transcriptions, Laurel Shackleford and Bill Weinberg, make a point of mentioning Slone's resentment of the stereotyping of mountain people in literature and television, and especially William Dutton's book. They quote her as saying, "it is one pack of lies from beginning to end and I've spent years a-trying to get people to not believe it" (74).[37] Throughout her interview she expresses her resentment the imposition of outsiders' values on the mountain people, especially her father:

> I know when [Alice Lloyd] first [started her school] this teacher tried to tell him about the great paintings, the masterpieces and all that, and he said, "Listen, I look at the painting that was painted by the most wonderful master of all. Jesus. Did you ever see a sunset? Did you ever see a rainbow? Did you ever get up in the morning and see the whole world covered with snow? Nothing's more beautiful than that.[38]

Slone's resentment reflects a clash of cultural values. To the mountaineers, nothing created by man could equal God's creation.

Even more contradictory is the perspective of Alice Slone, Verna Mae's cousin. Dutton, who calls her another Alice (Lloyd) , devotes several pages to the story of Alice's education at Caney Creek where at the age of thirteen, she was sent to high school in Cleveland, Ohio with the provision that when she was asked to return she would do so without question. After her graduation from the University of Ohio, she was considering marriage when Alice Lloyd commanded her to return to Kentucky to establish Lotts Creek Settlement School in a neighboring county. "I cried bitterly when the word came to go back to Kentucky," she told Greene. It seems she felt she had no choice but to go.[39]

Dutton portrays Alice Slone as a happy product of Caney Creek, doing what she was trained to do, educating the mountain children. However, when interviewed for the 1977 Appalachian Oral History Project, she mentions her "work" at Lotts only briefly in reference to feeling responsible for the suffering of others. Her response to the question of what life was like before the coming of outside influences conveys a feeling of loss: "Well, in some ways it was very ideal, of course, because we did have the beautiful woods, we had everything that nature gives, but none of the things that civilization gives. The woods themselves offered food. There were roots, berries, the sap of trees. We lived well."[40] If Alice Slone seems ambivalent about her life, perhaps it is because in assessing her gains and losses, she realizes that in exchange for education and "civilization," she has internalized Alice Lloyd's message of duty and lost the freedom to make choices for her own fulfillment.

Unquestionably, the settlement workers were instrumental in bringing improvements in the lives of the people in the regions they served. Greene points out that teaching people the value of putting screens on windows to keep out the flies, building proper outhouses, using individual drinking cups, and improved methods of preparing and preserving food led to a decrease in the incidence of health problems associated with poor sanitation such as trachoma and

typhoid fever.

However, the preference for students from middle-class rural backgrounds limited inclusion of miner's children and restricted the influence of the school on the region as a whole.[41] One might also argue that the focus on tradition and cultural purity may have inhibited mountain people's transition into modern society. In their attempts to recreate a romantic and idealized past, the settlement women were either unwilling or unable to recognize and confront the reality of other forces acting on the mountain culture and to prepare women to effectively deal with the challenges of the future. As Greene points out, in later years, after Ethel de Long Zande joined Pettit at Pine Mountain, the two women did make a greater effort to involve themselves in health care programs, school board elections, social fieldwork, and even promoted patriotism and encouraged young mountain men to volunteer as soldiers in World War I. At no time, however, did they challenge the patriarchal power structure of the mountain culture. As Whisnant stresses,

> In the surviving records of Hindman Settlement School I discovered no indication that the school ever attempted to serve as a community forum for . . . social and political ideas, or that it envisioned or instituted any program or initiative designed to challenge the new order or redress any of the abusive social, economic, or political circumstances that paid for John C. Mayo's house an his butlers, and undergirded the eastern Kentucky empire of control. As a result, the school was left with a conventional academic program—taken over increasingly by the public schools—and finally with a set of cultural endeavors that can only be called romantic and contrived.[42]

In order for any rescue effort to be successful, it would have been necessary for the settlement founders to concentrate their efforts on teaching women how to empower themselves in the modern age, and to find ways to end their economic dependency. Unlike their urban sisters who had found political activism the route to effecting social change, these women were rooted in a Victorian ideology which prevented them from challenging the patriarchal political system and exerting the influence needed to effect economic reforms that might have granted the people of eastern Kentucky, especially the women, a share in the wealth of their resources.

[1] Quotation from the "Foreword" by Loyal Jones from *The Quare Women's Journals: May Stone & Katherine Pettit's Summers in the Kentucky Mountains and the Founding of the Hindman Settlement School.* (Ashland, KY: The Jesse Stuart Foundation, 1997).

[2] Paul Boyer, *Urban Masses and Moral Order in America, 1820-1920.* (Cambridge, Mass: Harvard UP, 1978).

[3] Peggy Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue: The Search for Female Moral Authority in the American West, 1874-1939.* (New York: Oxford UP, 1990), p. 4.

[4] Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue,* p. 4.

[5] Ibid., p. 33.

[6] Jacqueline Jones, *Soldiers of Light and Love: Northern Teachers and Georgia Blacks, 1865-1873.* (Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1980); David E. Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine: The Politics of Culture in an American Region.* (Chapel Hill and London, U of North Carolina P, 1983). p. 10.

[7] Paul Harvey, *Redeeming the South: Religious Culture and Racial Identities Among Southern Baptists, 1865-1925.* (Chapel Hill, U of North Carolina P, 1997). pp. 220, 221.

[8] Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine*, p. 3.

[9] Ronald D. Eller, *Miners, Millhands and Mountaineers: Industrialization of the Appalachian South, 1880-1930.* (Knoxville: U of Tennessee P, 1992). Introduction, xvi.

[10] James Greene, III, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains: the Formative Years of the Pine Mountain Settlement School, 1913-1930.* [Diss. Ohio State University, 1982], p 15.

[11] Ibid., p. 43.

[12] Harvey, *Redeeming the South,* p. 221.

[13] Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine*, p. 3.

[14] Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains,* p. 15; Stilgoe, "*Landschaft* and Linearity." p 77.

[15] Rhonda George England, *Voices from the History of Teaching: Katherine Pettit, May Stone and Elizabeth Watts at Hindman Settlement School, 1899-1956.* [Diss. University of Kentucky, 1990].p. 110; Alan F. Davis, *Spearheads of Reform: The Social Settlements and the Progressive Movement, 1890-1914,* pp. 18-19.

[16] Jess Stoddard, ed. *The Quare Women's Journals,* p. 60.

[17] Much of the information in this paper came from studies of settlement schools in the Eastern Kentucky mountains and, where available, the histories of individual founders and teachers. Jerry Davis' history of Alice Lloyd College in Pippa Passes, *Miracle on Caney Creek* and, in addition to England's dissertation, James S. Green III's *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains: The Formative Years of Pine Mountain Settlement School 1913-1930;* England, *Voices from the History of Teaching;* and an excerpt from William S. Dutton's *Stay on, Stranger: An Extraordinary Story of the Kentucky Mountains.* (New York? Farrar, Straus, and Young, 1954), reprinted in *Reader's Digest*, Pleasantville, New York, Jan. 1954, pp. 1-5. Histories of the three settlement schools discussed in these studies and actual interviews with some of the founders and directors allow a personal look at their motivations, teaching philosophies, and curriculum design. I used the rule of common knowledge and did not cite references for information repeated in three or more sources.

[18] Loyal Jones, "Foreword," *The Quare Women's Journals,*

[19] David E. Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine: The Politics of Culture in an American Region.* (Chapel Hill: U of North Carolina P, 1983). References to Curry Desha, pp. 25, 40, 41, for reference to Madeline at summer camp, see p. 39 and note 22, p. 273, for reference to Sophinisba see pp. 38-39.

[20] Stoddard, *The Quare Women's Journals,* Introduction, p 33.

[21] Sara M. Evans, *Born for Liberty: A History of Women in America,* New York: Simon, 1997, p 147. Allen F. Davis, *American Heroine: The Life and Legend of Jane Addams.* New York: Oxford UP, 1973, pp. 23, 30, 102. Alice Kessler-Harris, *Out to Work: A History of Wage-Earning Women in the United States,* New York: Oxford UP, 1982, pp. 113-114.

[22] Stoddard, *The Quare Women's Journals,* Introduction, pp. 31-32.

[23] James S. Greene, III, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains: The Formative Years of the Pine Mountain Settlement 1913-1930.* Diss. Ohio State University, 1982, Ch. 1, "When Will You Women Come an Larn Us Things?" John R. Stilgoe, "*Landschaft* and Linearity: Two Archetypes of Landscape," *Out of the Woods: Essays in Environmental History,* eds. Char Miller and Hal Rothman, Pittsburgh: U of Pittsburgh P, 1997, p 77.

[24] England, *Voices from the History of Teaching,* p. 111; Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine,* pp. 29, 81-85, 101; Davis, *Miracle on Caney Creek,* pp. 52-54.

[25] England, *Voices from the History of Teaching,* p. 136.

[26] Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine,* page 13.

[27] Robert Weibe, *The Search for Order, 1877-1920.* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1967). p. 117.

[28] Pascoe, *Relations of Rescue,* p.4.

[29] Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains,* p 20; England, *Voices from the History of Teaching* p. 84. Quoted from letter, 1889.

[30] Horace Kephart, *Our Southern Highlanders: A Narrative of Adventure in the Southern Appalachians and a Study of Life Among the Mountaineers.* 1913. (Knoxville: U of Tennessee P. 1990). Pages 331-332.

[31] Davis, *Miracle on Caney Creek* , pp. 27-28; Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains* p. 156.

[32] Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains*, chapter 10, "A Leavening Influence in the Neighborhood," Davis, *Miracle on Caney Creek*, pages 78-85.

[33] Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains,* p. 15; John R. Stilgoe, "*Landschaft* and Linearity: Two Archetypes of Landscape," *Out of the Woods: Essays in Environmental History,* eds. Char Miller and Hal Rothman. (Pittsburgh: U of Pittsburgh P, 1997). p. 77.

[34] In order to fully comprehend the impact of such prestigious women on isolated mountain communities, I consulted studies of settlement schools in the Eastern Kentucky mountains and, where available, the histories of individual founders and teachers. These previously cited studies contain, in addition to well-documented histories of the three settlement schools discussed in this study, actual interviews with some of the founders and directors, thus allowing a personal look at their motivations, teaching philosophies, and curriculum design. Both England and Green's dissertations feature excepts from the diaries and letters of the founders. Katherine Pettit in particular had great respect of mountain crafts and culture, but like other reformers, believed that education was the principal means of "civilizing" the mountain people and bringing them into the American mainstream. While the schools were secular, included with the teaching of three R's,

domestic skills for girls and industrial training for boys was a large dose of Christian morality and Bible lessons.

[35] Lucy Furman, *The Quare Women.* Boston: The Atlantic Monthly Press, 1923.

[36] Dutton, "Stay on, Stranger." The reference here is to the condensed version.

[37] Laurel Shackelford and Bill Weinberg, eds., *Our Appalachia: An Oral History edited by Laurel Shackelford and Bill Weinberg.* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1977). p. 74.

[38] Ibid. P. 75.

[39] Dutton, "Stay on, Stranger." p. 14.

[40] Shackleford, *Our Appalachia,* p. 65.

[41] Greene, *Progressives in the Kentucky Mountains,* pp. 72-80.

[42] Whisnant, *All That is Native and Fine.* pp.77-78. The reference to John C. Mayo concerns the visit of two Hindman teachers to Mayo's mansiion in Paintsville, Kentucky, where they had "a glorious time" enjoying his "wonderful" home with "beauteous things to eat" [and] three butlers to wait on them." This account indicates that they were either unaware or unconcerned that Mayo's wealth had been obtained at the expense of the very people they had come to "civilize". pp.77, 78.